

two policy papers
policing and sectarian division
urban regeneration and sectarian division

(3 photographs)

First published 1996
by Templegrove Action Research Limited
13 Pump Street, Derry Londonderry, BT48 6JG

© Templegrove Action Research Limited
Written by Marie Smyth and Ruth Moore
Typeset by Pauline Collins, Ruth Moore and Marie Smyth
Photographs by Ruth Moore, Marie Smyth and Madeleine Callaghan
Final editing by Marie Smyth

Printed by Print n Press, Foyle Road, Derry Londonderry

All Rights Reserved

ISBN 1 900071 00 5

TWO POLICY PAPERS

**POLICING AND SECTARIAN DIVISION
IN DERRY LONDONDERRY**

prepared by
Ruth Moore
and

**URBAN REGENERATION AND SECTARIAN
DIVISION**

prepared by
Marie Smyth

Prepared for public consultations with
The Police Authority for Northern Ireland
and
The Department of the Environment for Northern Ireland

Project Director
and final editor
Marie Smyth

TEMPLEGROVE ACTION RESEARCH LIMITED
Derry Londonderry

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Our thanks are due to the people who assisted us in clarifying the ideas contained in the submissions. The submissions were prepared with the impetus, support and backing of the Board of Templegrove Action Research, whose input to the clarification of the ideas contained in the submissions was invaluable. Tony Doherty, William Temple and Robin Percival's inputs were particularly useful in pointing up some of the more difficult issues. The Board did not have a consensus of views about many of the issues raised, and ultimately it fell to the employees of Templegrove to produce submissions which addressed the issues in a manner which was inclusive and yet did not deny the complexity and range of views on the issues in question. We hope we have succeeded in doing so, particularly in relation to the policing submission, which was, by far, the most difficult issue we have written on. The Advisory Group, particularly Barney Devine, Denis McCoy, Brendan Murtagh and Donnie Sweeney provided an enormously valuable sounding board and source of information and further contacts. In relation to the Urban Regeneration Submission, we consulted with a large range of individuals and groups, including the political parties, and these are acknowledged at the beginning of the submission in Section 2. Pauline Collins, as always, managed the office, typeset the texts and offered valuable practical and political insights which went well beyond the call of duty.

Finally, thanks are due to our core funders, The Central Community Relations Unit of the Central Secretariat, the Joseph Rowntree Charitable Trust, The Londonderry Initiative, and The Ireland Fund. Without their financial assistance this work would not have been possible.

Marie Smyth
April, 1996

CONTENTS

	Page
Introduction	6
Section 1	
Submission to the Police Authority for Northern Ireland	7
Summary of policing submission	17
Correspondence with Sub-Divisional Commander, R.U.C.	19
Section 2	
Submission to the DOE NI on Urban Regeneration and Sectarian Division	27
Summary of recommendations	44
Footnotes	48
Bibliography	49
 Appendix 1: Templegrove Action Research: the background	 51
Appendix 2: Population migration and segregation in Derry Londonderry	52

Introduction

Templegrove Action Research Limited was established in December 1993 with the aim of researching and documenting aspects of sectarian division in the North West. In September 1994, we began a two year investigation into segregation and enclave communities in Derry Londonderry which was funded by CCRU, The Joseph Rowntree Trust, the Ireland Fund, and the Londonderry Initiative. The project was to investigate aspects of the shifting population balance between Protestants and Catholics in Derry Londonderry. As part of that investigation, research was conducted in two enclave areas, Gobnascale (Catholic) and The Fountain (Protestant) in which some of the central questions were directed at uncovering the reasons why people remain living in certain areas, whilst others move out; what is the quality of life for those who remain; and how people perceive themselves on the majority-minority axis.

As part of that brief, Templegrove Action Research Limited was committed to make policy recommendations on any aspect of public policy related to sectarian division. To date, Templegrove has made submissions to the Divisional Planning Office on aspects of area planning and sectarian division, and to the Police Authority for Northern Ireland on policing and sectarian division. These submission on policing and urban regeneration fall within that area of Templegrove's work.

The political context

Just as the project was beginning work, first Republican and then Loyalist paramilitaries announced cease-fires. These developments had a marked impact on our work. located, as it is, in the heart of the divisions and history of violence in and between the two communities. The project team and the Board had to re-examine their priorities in order to ensure that the work of the project made a positive impact on the situation locally, and maximised the opportunities which had opened up with the announcements of the cease-fires. The project has operated in a period of great political uncertainty, and these submissions were prepared at different points in that period. At some points, hopes for positive developments in planning the future ran high, and at other, perhaps more recent points, pessimism and doubts characterised the atmosphere in which we worked. To some extent this is inevitably reflected in these submissions. Even the process of opening up for public submission and debate aspects of policy making in Northern Ireland was a departure from the previous experience of citizens here. The so-called democratic deficit in Northern Ireland, and the previously remote way in which policy had been formulated meant that the opportunity to participate in the formation of public policy through public consultation in a relatively violence-free environment was a new and challenging one. Even the process of preparing the submissions was different. The range of interests we were able to consult, and the ease with which we did so, was affected by the cease-fires.

In hindsight, our work was a part of a flurry of excitement after the cease-fires, in which people began to energetically explore the kind of society they wished to live in. At the time of writing this introduction, the IRA cease-fire has ended, and the future no longer looks as positive as it did when some of these submissions were prepared. We hope, nonetheless, that they have some value in relation both to the future of policing, and to the work of urban regeneration, in a society that - cease-fires or no - continues to be divided.

Marie Smyth
April 5, 1996.

6

Submission to

The Police Authority for Northern Ireland
Community Consultation Unit
on

Policing and Sectarian Division

prepared by

Ruth Moore

Community Researcher

assisted by Marie Smyth, Project Director

May 1995

photo of Landrovers with title superimposed

Introduction

Templegrove Action Research Ltd (see Appendix 1) acknowledge the potential impact of the cease fires on the future role and priorities of policing in Northern Ireland. The IRA and Combined Loyalist cease fires signalling an end to the political violence of these groups, gave rise to questions about the future role and priorities of the police. Until this point policing had focused largely (but not entirely) on political violence, policy and practice being directed at combating terrorism, under Emergency Provisions Legislation. The cease fires, therefore, have required a radical shift in emphasis in policing practice and substantial alterations to police operations. It remains to be seen how effectively these changes have been implemented and what their short and long term effects will be.

The reality of political divisions in Northern Ireland is broader than the paramilitary threat which the policing authorities speak of when addressing the special circumstances of Northern Ireland. Political diversity and division in Northern Ireland does have implications for policing, namely the extensive polarisation of two communities and residential segregation.

Templegrove Action Research are responding to the community consultation initiatives, since the cease fires, taken by the Police Authority and the Royal Ulster Constabulary. We have read the Police Authority report, "The Work of the Police Authority 1991-1994", the N.I.O Discussion Paper "Policing in the Community", the R.U.C. Charter and have responded to the R.U.C. Questionnaire. We are in the process of carrying out research within Derry Londonderry on sectarian division and in particular on residential segregation. We are carrying out two field studies of two different communities within the city, that resident in the Fountain area and the other resident in the Gobnascale area. At this stage we would like to offer some preliminary comments and recommendations from our preliminary community research. We wish to indicate that we may have further findings which are relevant to strategic planning of policing and would welcome the opportunity to present these at the end of our research period, to the Police Authority and all other relevant policing authorities.

Templegrove's Central Point

The submission is concerned primarily with the future of policing within residentially segregated areas and in particular enclave areas. Comments will also be made about policing matters generally, within Northern Ireland,- a politically diverse and segregated society.

The central point to this submission is that a future police service needs to specifically address factors relating to sectarian division and residential segregation. To do so allows the policing authorities of Northern Ireland to address the concerns of residentially segregated communities and specific needs of enclave areas. It also permits aspects of policing which are affected by and contribute to the perpetuation of sectarian division to be addressed.

Templegrove Action Research notes the recent efforts to consult with the community taken

by the current Police Authority and RUC, the written and verbal recognition of the need to establish an efficient and effective police service and to be representative and accountable. However, it is, in our view, impossible to achieve this without directly and urgently addressing issues of sectarian division at all levels of policing and in all areas, - but in particular in policy, planning and training.

8

Policing in the Future - Priorities and Roles

This section will reflect upon what a future police service could be. It will address current community debates and will refer to principles of policing, the legislative framework, political control, community support/ consensus and community policing. Generally, there is a need for policing priorities and roles to reflect the needs and concerns of the communities they serve. These concerns are with domestic violence, child sexual abuse, safety on streets, security of homes, crime, political intimidation and threat of political violence of the community as a whole. Generally, policing should efficiently address in both a preventative and responsive manner community concerns, within a framework which respects diversity, upholds principles of equality protecting the rights of all individuals and groups.

Principles

The Police Authorities Report 1994 acknowledges that the crime rate in Northern Ireland is considerably lower than the recorded crime rate in England and Wales. This often goes unremarked but is an important factor when considering the kind of policing service desirable in the future. Setting aside the political conflict, Northern Ireland has in fact been a very law abiding society. The preferred policing strategy is a *minimalist* approach, rather than the maximum, heavy policing approach as has been known in the past. A non-militaristic approach is a key element to establishing a sound partnership between the police service and the community. The carrying of arms, a practice which has become normalised within Northern Ireland, is one which maintains a level of fear in individuals and communities.

Ethos

"We have chosen as our theme 'Policing in partnership'. Why? Because, quite simply, we see partnership as a critical factor in developing policing in Northern Ireland." Sir Hugh Annesley, QPM, Chief Constable: Opening Address, RUC Information Forum on Policing

The language of partnership reflects certain principles and a commitment to a policing service which would be representative, accountable, open to all to participate in and equally responsive to all policing needs is particularly welcome. However, we feel that the establishment of partnership is hypothetical at this stage, as the RUC give few indicators as to how this partnership is to be achieved. Similarly, there are few indicators of the ability of all the policing authorities to address underlying and broader aspects of policing, central to partnership, which are outlined within this submission.

The opportunities for all communities, regardless of religious belief, political persuasion, ethnicity or class to work in partnership with a police service must be offered by the policing authorities. We welcome the Police Authorities Community Consultation, recognising that it has not been without it's own difficulties, as well as the RUC's consultation with local communities on their formation of their five year strategy as steps towards partnership. However, there remain problems with the RUC's use of selectivity in the consultative process and exclusion of certain groups from it.

Legislative Framework

A police service is as good as the legislative framework which empowers it. Legislation should protect the human rights of all citizens and clearly set out the legal parameters within which society and a policing service is expected to exist and operate.

9

Policing within Northern Ireland has operated under Emergency Legislation and been conducted in the atmosphere of *community non-consensus*. This is because the legitimacy of the state of Northern Ireland as part of the United Kingdom, has been contested by a sizeable minority population of Northern Ireland, since its establishment.

The predominant perception of the current policing service is not of a police service but rather of a security force policing an emergency. Emergency Legislation existed prior to partition and since partition and has continued to exist in a variety of forms. Emergency provisions exist under the current Northern Ireland (Emergency Provisions) Act 1973, the Prevention of Terrorism (Temporary provisions) Act 1989, which was renewed in 1995, and far reaching police powers, exist which were introduced under ordinary legislation such as the Police and Criminal Evidence (Northern Ireland) Order 1989.

The existence of these powers give total discretion to the security forces, at the expense of protecting the rights of the citizen. A police service with a history of possession of total discretion and without experience of judicial or lay monitoring of their operations is likely to possess certain characteristics at this stage: resistance to democratic accountability, exclusive internal cohesion, an elite consciousness etc. A population with experience of being policed by such a force are likely to possess certain other characteristics: a weak sense of the equality of citizens before the law, an erosion of trust in the police, a disinvestment in the police and judicial process as a way of establishing and maintaining law and order, suspicion and fear of the police and of the state.

The following cases illustrate that Emergency Legislation, including provisions under the Prevention of Terrorism Act, are considered to be unjust.

BROGAN ET AL VS UK, EUR. CT, 1988
BRANNIGAN AND MACBRIDE VS UK, EUR CT, 1993
IRELAND VS UK, 1978
MURREY VS UK, pending

Templegrove Action Research note the difficulty of the current police service to carry out the policing role within a conflict situation and the paramilitary threat prior to the cease fires and we do acknowledge the sacrifices made by individual serving members. Alongside this however, Templegrove Action Research also notes the reluctance of policing authorities to recognise state violence, continuing to view state violence and terrorism as legitimate force. There is a failure on the part of the policing authorities to recognise a number of factors: the intimidating effect of emergency provisions; the harassment of individuals often perceived often as the harassment of a whole community; intimidation of both communities; interrogation procedures; use of informers; wrongful arrest; state violence carried out under alleged "shoot to kill" practice. This failure remains an obstacle to the acceptability of existing policing authorities to sections of the community. These policing issues are central to building trust, with both nationalist/republican and unionist/loyalist communities. The willingness of the policing authorities to acknowledge state violence as well as other paramilitary violence is a test to building trust.

Templegrove Action Research understand the heated nature of the debate on the future of policing as partially a reflection of diverse experiences of policing and believe that the creation of a fair and just legislative framework is necessary for the development of a fair and just policing service. Legislation which violates human rights should be repealed.

10

Political Control

"...the RUC should be freed from political direction and control." (The Work of the Police Authority 1991-1994: 6)

Templegrove Action Research acknowledge the sentiments of the Police Authority and endorse that freedom from political control is a requirement of any police force which is committed to providing a quality service to all of the community. However, we differ in our analysis, in that all police services operate within political systems, and it is unrealistic to expect them to be free from politics or be apolitical. Therefore, in our view, it is desirable that policing services of the future are freed from *any one* political ideology.

Within the specific context of Northern Ireland, one perception of the current police system is that it is not representative of the existing political diversity. In the past one indication of the problem is the membership of the RUC.

"In 1993 Catholics accounted for 7.7% of the strength of the RUC and 10.5% of Authority Staff." (The Work of the Police Authority 1991-1994 : 35)

The first step to such a police force is taken in the acknowledgement of the degree of and nature of political direction and control internally. There is a failure to effectively address the significance of the 92.3% Protestant membership of the RUC when it comes to fulfilling its aims "to provide a high quality effective police service to all the people of Northern Ireland." (RUC Citizen's Charter).

There are historical reasons for sectarian divisions in Northern Ireland, which permeate all aspects of life in Northern Ireland, from education, housing, to employment and this remains a grave situation in terms of fair employment and equal opportunity. The current upward trend in job applications from the Catholic population from 12.2% to 21.5%, (RUC Information Forum on Policing: 1995) and which may increase further, is noted. However, this figure only represents the increase in applications and not in appointments. It does not deal with promotion within the RUC nor will it significantly impact on the current composition of the RUC overall. In spite of initiatives to attract Catholics into the RUC, the composition has not radically changed. There has been no effective questioning of why this situation exists nor has any effective strategy been developed to significantly change the situation.

Whilst not all Protestants are Unionist and not all Catholics are Nationalist, there has been a complex political polarisation of two communities into two political camps, which is simplistically but most often described as being along religious lines. Seamus Mallon, MP (SDLP), amongst others has pointed out that there are fewer impediments stopping Catholics from joining the RUC than there are preventing nationalists from being recruited. This is because of a perception of the RUC as a 100% unionist police force. There has been no research carried out to the internal political aspirations and identities of serving officers of the RUC. The perception of the existing police service as being either neutral/apolitical and the perception of it as a unionist police service will need to be engaged with if the

composition of a future police service is to be politically representative.

Templegrove Action Research further notes the internal fining of an R.U.C. officer for marching with the Apprentice Boys and the Orange Order. The individual right to participate in the practice of these organisations is now undergoing a High Court review. Open acknowledgement of internal and political control and direction and addressing the

11

perceived imbalance, within a legislative framework which upholds human rights should prevent the infringement of serving officers political and cultural rights.

The "Royal Ulster Constabulary Citizen's Charter" contains an outline of the RUC's commitment to providing a Quality Service within which the following recognition is made:

"effective policing depends upon your support. We appreciate that the quality of our service is an important factor in retaining that support. The reputation of the RUC can be improved, or diminished, by the quality of contacts between people and police officers." (RUC Citizen's Charter: 2)

A number of issues emerge:

(1) The effectiveness and efficiency of policing in the future will depend on how much the police authorities are representative of all sections of the community.

(2) This question of acceptability requires urgent attention. The lack of acceptability means that a vacuum exists into which various groups have moved and attempted to provide (problematically) alternative forms of policing. The assumption that existing acceptability is unproblematic does not enable a differentiation between the reasons why sections find the existing service acceptable.

(3) The question of political control is important for the community and therefore a Police Authority which is representative of the whole community, should be accountable for strategic planning.

Community Support

Ultimately, the police officers of the future, are not only police officers, they are also citizens. They must continue to live in this community in their off-duty time. A future where off-duty police officers can be open about their occupation, can move freely and safely in the community in the pursuit of leisure and family activities, and where police officers and their families are fully integrated into both the Catholic and Protestant communities they serve is the kind of future we consider worth working towards.

Due to the role played by the RUC in the conflict of the last 25 years, police officers as an occupational group have been particularly affected by the troubles. The number of officers killed and injured in the conflict is the most dramatic and severe aspect of the impact of the troubles on the RUC. Alongside this, the experience of living in a society where police officers have had to be constantly vigilant and on guard for security reasons, and in which they have had to protect their identity, means that RUC personnel and their families have led lives which have set them apart from civilian life and society to a large extent. In addition, the physical and emotional effects of long-term exposure to violence and threat have often gone unattended and unaddressed. RUC officers and their families as citizens are entitled, as are other citizens, to expect the support and help of society in adjusting to past losses and present changing circumstances. This support and help has not always been available in the

past, yet in our view, if the conflict and disturbances of the past are to be successfully resolved and put behind us, such support and help is crucially important.

It is unrealistic to expect trust and mutual respect between the RUC and certain groups to appear overnight, simply because cease fires are announced. We consider that the establishment of trust will require honesty, flexibility, courage and compromise on the part of all parties, as well as a willingness to negotiate.

12

It is difficult to ask a body of people such as the RUC, who have been under attack for many years, to understand the grievances of their attackers. Yet this enormous challenge to the RUC must be met if they are to establish themselves as a body with credibility in all sections of the community. Furthermore an equal and opposite challenge exists for groups and individuals who have experienced state abuse, including murder and wrongful arrest, and hold long standing grievances, against the RUC.

Injured police officers

There are numbers of police officers who have been injured and disabled in the troubles. This group of people, who have been living with disabilities and the loss of an occupation, often in very isolated circumstances deserve the support and attention of the community. They have much in common with other groups of people injured in the troubles and with other disabled people, yet have been segregated from these people because of security reasons. Again, the integration of these ex-members of the RUC into society would become possible if some broader conciliation occurred between the RUC and groups with whom there is antagonism.

Community Policing - Who Polices Who?

Community Policing is a current debate going on within communities at present as well as amongst the policing authorities. One primary concern of both Catholic/nationalist and Protestant/unionist working class communities is *"who polices who?"*.

Some issues related to the representativeness of the police force are briefly outlined here:

We agree with the approach advocated by Police Authority, when they said:

"Above all, a new Authority must be fully representative of the community by gender, geography, belief and background". (The work of the Police Authority 1991- 1994: 6)

However, we would argue that this aspiration of the Police Authority's 1994 report, should be a principle which applies to the entire police service.

Religious Belief and Political Persuasion

The fact that there is limited support for the current police force in Nationalist/Republican areas leads to gaps in policing and is perceived as part of the overall political problem. There is a need for a police officers to be acceptable to all communities as there are specific problems and certain difficulties in policing on issues of a politically sensitive nature. The placing of Catholic/Nationalist officers into Nationalist areas, will also have an outcome for Protestant/Unionist minority enclaves, if not acknowledged. In the course of our work we have heard accounts of police officers failure to maintain a professional political detachment. This is a matter which has serious implications for police training but also for the culture within the RUC as an organisation

Class

The upward mobility of police officers, the perceived security needs of police officers and intimidation out of their homes, are factors which contribute to the segregation of police officers from their own communities; they often choose to live in more middle class Protestant or mixed areas. Although there may be many police officers who are from upper working class and usually Protestant backgrounds, most of the police officers policing

13

working class areas, whether Protestant or Catholic areas rarely have a similar lifestyle to those they police. In any society, class is a policing issue. Working class areas are often stigmatised as ghettos, whilst a blind eye is turned to middle class crimes. It is generally, the crime of working classes that is treated as most problematic by the police forces.

Geography

In the past, the practice of allocating serving police officers to communities with which they are not familiar has meant they have not been in touch with the politics, problems and people of the local communities. Whilst this policy has been regarded as necessary in the past for security reasons, we consider that it has implications for the ability of the police to operate effectively in local communities.

Gender

It is estimated that 52% of Northern Ireland's population is female, yet approximately 10% of RUC personnel are female. We welcome the Authority's expressed interest in ensuring female officer play a more fuller role. However, we would welcome a ongoing monitoring of the roles women police officers play and targets for future participation of women within the police. We recognise the valuable role women officers play in dealing with crimes of child and domestic abuse. We are concerned, however, that women officers are sidelined into these areas. Women need to be represented in all aspects of police work, and at all levels of seniority.

Conclusion

Policing in the future could be dramatically different from past and current policing. If future policing is going to have the support of all sections of community in Northern Ireland and if service is going to be fully open for all individuals to participate in, without fully compromising political and cultural rights of an individual and or group, to any significant degree, the policing authorities need to be seen as fair, representative and accountable.

RESIDENTIAL SEGREGATION, ENCLAVE COMMUNITIES AND POLICING

This section will address:

- (a) the implications of political division and violence for policing and
- (b) some of the problems in enclave communities, in relation to policing.

Political Violence and Residential Segregation.

Templegrove Action Research notes that the Police Authority, in the 1991-1994 Report, set the debate around the future role of policing in the context of "civil disorder" and makes reference to "our volatile society". The Police Authority submission to Northern Ireland Office in November 1993, stated that it was:

"mindful of the fact the RUC can not always perform the role of a normal police force because of the constant paramilitary a threat which it faces".

The political divisions, polarisation of people into two communities and the continuing trend towards residential segregation have extensive implications for policing. Political violence, intimidation and fear of violence has led many people to feel unsafe living in mixed communities, for a variety of reasons. Between the years of 1969 - 1974, 60,000 people

14

left their homes, in the Belfast area alone, the result being segregated streets and communities, and the establishment of 13 "peace-lines". (see Murtagh, 1994) The development of "territory" remains instrumental to the perceived needs for protection and is how communities are maintained. Political division and political violence has been a predominant trigger in the facilitation of residential segregation in Northern Ireland. Protestant housing estates, Catholic housing estates, security force housing estates (e.g. Ballykelly) "no man's (sic) land", "interface areas" and "enclave" areas are all familiar features of the settlement patterns of contemporary Northern Ireland.

The significance of the settlement patterns in relation to policing, in particular residential segregation are:

- of a (1) Some of these segregated areas have been "No go" areas for the RUC, because perceived threat of the lives of RUC members and as a result these areas are not policed or are policed in a different manner by the state forces. The presence of the RUC within these areas being perceived at the very least as being antagonistic
- and (2) The formation of false perceptions regarding policing - Perceptions by one community of how the other community is policed can be often skewed, uninformed and/or mis-informed, because of the segregated and polarised nature of the society. Often both communities feel that the "other" community are not properly policed the law is administered more punitively in their community than in the other community.

Residential Segregation and Enclave Areas

The settlement patterns which have come about have resulted in the creation of enclave areas, where one residential population living in a particular area is surrounded by a residential population of the other sort. Templegrove Action Research has conducted an investigation, using census data into the extent of population shifts and segregation within the city. Later work will examine the reasons for these shifts, which we anticipate will include political violence, sectarian intimidation and attacks among other factors..

Population Migrations and Segregation in Derry Londonderry (See Appendix 2 for tables)

In order to quantify the population trends in the city area, we extracted small area statistics on a grid square basis from the 1971, 1981, and 1991 Census of Population for Northern Ireland. Our preliminary work on the census data for the city area shows:

1. a change in the ratio of Protestants to Catholics in the city, due to substantial decline in the overall total Protestant population in the city as a whole.

2. an internal shift of Protestants from the west to the east banks;
3. an increase in internal segregation in two communities, which we suggest may be indicative of a wider trend towards increased segregation.

Residential segregation is a feature of life in Derry Londonderry, with other regions of Northern Ireland reflecting similar patterns. The trend towards increased segregation have

15

implications for policing and the provision of an effective and efficient police service. Murtagh (1994)(4) suggests that segregation is not necessarily a bad thing, and segregation performs certain functions for the enclave (and indeed the integrated) community. From the preliminary work on the project, it is clear that segregated communities have strong views about segregation and about the quality of their lives and services within such communities.

Policing in Enclave Areas

Enclave areas, by their very nature are likely to have particular needs for policing. From our field studies in the Top of the Hill area and the Fountain area of Derry Londonderry, we are aware of different perceptions of the police and concerns around policing.

General Community Attitudes

Top of the Hill: Attitudes to the RUC vary across a spectrum of opinion from total suspicion and rejection of the RUC, through embarrassment at social visits paid by passing RUC community police, to some form of acceptance. However the predominant feeling is of suspicion, mistrust and reluctance or unwillingness to associate with or use the police.

Fountain: A number of different attitudes to the RUC present themselves, ranging from active support of the RUC, engagement with the community police, regular reporting to the police, to suspicion of motives, mistrust in their ability to police satisfactorily.

Both communities are concerned that the police officers in the area, sent out in an emergency are not from the area, do not know the problems of the area and do not have a good working relationship with the local community.

Specific Community Concerns

In a climate of political uncertainty and the experience of political violence, territorial boundaries are crucially important to a community's sense of security. As a result "peace" lines, security fences and barriers have been erected and "no man's (sic) lands" have been established throughout Northern Ireland. In the areas we are studying, the security fence around the Fountain area and no man's (sic) land around Gobnascale are examples of this. Policing of such areas becomes a matter of developing strategies aimed at reducing and containing violence. Boundary demarcations are attempts at controlling entry in the area, are also a means of securing the area, and offering protection to the resident population from violent attack. However, enclaves also experience fear and vulnerability, from the sense of being surrounded on all sides by the "other" community, and from the ease with which the area can be sealed off. Particularly when the security forces are perceived as hostile, or

are on active operations, fear can run very high in enclave areas.

Within enclave areas, the needs for protection from violence varies according to location within the enclave. People who reside on the periphery of the enclave area, beside the flashpoints which are often the entry routes into the area, have a very different experience to those living in the centre of the enclave. Those living on the periphery or near the flash/entry points often have experienced nightly petrol bombing and stone throwing.

The Intimidating Effect of Violence in Enclave Areas

Violence and in particular vandalism of property, such as the damaging of cars, within enclave areas by people from outside the area is likely to be experienced as more

16

intimidating than violence within non-enclave areas from "outsiders". Intimidation and violence within enclave areas is perceived as a threat to the whole community. Similarly, within the Fountain area, sectarian attacks to property, occurring at the weekends, near access points, is experienced as a threat to the whole community. These situations need to be efficiently dealt with and ultimately involve a policing and a community response.

One of the reasons cited by residents within the Top of the Hill area, for considering moving out of the area prior to the cease fires was the constant police and army presences and the fear that young boys and men who were repeatedly stopped and questioned by the police would come into conflict with them and be punished as a result. The quality of life in the area was dramatically affected by policing practices especially for families with young boys and men. The difference in the policing problems between the two areas can be explained by the difference in political identities rather than their specific problems and needs for a police service.

There is a view in both communities that the current policing system is unable to deal with the particular experiences of enclave communities effectively and efficiently. This is largely due to the unacceptability of the current police force within the nationalist community, which prevents some nationalists from working alongside the police and isolates those who do within their own communities. Experiences of enclave communities also point to the need for a police force which is acceptable to all sections of the community.

There are also fears in Protestant and in Catholic minority areas of regionalised policing. These are predominantly due to experiences within the community of conflict and sectarianism. The existence of these fears reinforces the importance of a police force free from any one political ideology. These matters should be taken into account in any future policing policy.

Conclusion

Policing in Northern Ireland to-day operates within a political context of a contested state, and has to a large extent been perceived as policing "the troubles". The eruption of political violence has extensive implications for policing, and also, notably, specific settlement patterns. For political and security reasons, Protestants, Catholics and members of security forces tend to live in separate areas. Segregation in Northern Ireland is a reality and enclave areas exist, and are particularly a feature of urban life here. The existence of these settlement patterns have implications for future policing policies, training and practice. The various communities have different experiences of, attitudes toward, and needs regarding policing. There is a need to engage robustly with these issues. of difference. In particular, the issue of acceptability of the current police service must be grasped and addressed

before progress can be made. The needs and concerns of all local communities must be taken into account in the strategic planning of policing in the future.

SUMMARY

1. Templegrove Action Research Ltd welcomes the opportunity to submit views on policing.
2. We submit that any attempt to understand policing issues, or to plan future policing services must take account of the central importance of sectarian division as a crucial issue in effective and acceptable policing.

17

3. The cease fires have created conditions in which pre- cease fires policing policy and practice requires urgent review and change.
4. Taking account of Northern Ireland's low crime rate, a minimalist unarmed policing approach is argued for.
5. Consultations on policing and participation in consultations should be inclusive of all citizens and all political divisions.
6. A competent legal framework within which police and citizens rights and responsibilities are clearly delineated and human rights are protected, is required.
7. The building of trust requires the recognition and acknowledgement of wrongs by all armed forces in Northern Ireland, including state armed forces as well as others.
8. The police service should be free from any one set of political interests.
9. The police service should be representative, within its ranks of all sections of the community as representativeness has a major bearing on acceptability, partnership and effective policing.
10. The question of acceptability of policing in Northern Ireland requires urgent attention. Current attitudes to policing should be established and taken into account in order to plan effective policing for the future.
11. Cultural and political rights of all citizens, including police officers should be protected.
12. Police officers should be as fully integrated as possible, in the communities in which they live and serve.
13. Serving police officers have lived under threat and have experienced violent acts over a period of years and have suffered as a result. They also have the right to support in adjusting to life in a peaceful society.
14. The police must be able to acknowledge genuinely held grievances which people hold as a result of past policing practice.

15. Injured and disabled police officers have the right to assistance in living with long term disabilities and social isolation.
16. The principle of equality should be central to police training and practice, in order that the police service is perceived as fair and "detached".
17. The addressing and elimination of class bias in the models of policing is desirable.
18. Equal opportunities should exist for women throughout a police service.
19. Residential segregation of the population into "Protestant" and "Catholic" areas has implications for policing practice.
20. Enclave areas often have different policing needs. The policing of boundary areas is
18
crucial to the sense of security, but need to be policed sensitively, with the fears of the enclave community and of the other community borne in mind.
21. Residents on the periphery of enclave areas have different policing needs to those who live in the centre of such areas.
22. Experiences of living in enclave communities and/or within minority groups, further highlight the need for a police service which is acceptable to all and accountable to all sections of community in Northern Ireland.

REFERENCES FOR THE POLICING SUBMISSION

1. Amnesty International: Political Killings in Northern Ireland. 1994. London, Amnesty International.
2. Blaney, Niall (1995) "Annesley 'Optimistic' that the peace will continue: Consensus on policing needed say RUC Chief" The Irish News, Thursday March 16. 1995.
3. McVeigh, R. (1994) Security Forces and Harassment in Northern Ireland. Belfast, Committee on the Administration of Justice.
4. Murtagh, B. (1994) Ethnic Space and the Challenge to Land Use Planning: A study of Belfast's Peace Lines. Belfast. Centre for Policy Research, Research Paper 7, May, 1994.
5. Northern Ireland Office. (1994) Policing in the Community. Policing Structures in Northern Ireland. Belfast. HMSO.
6. Police Authority for Northern Ireland. (1994) The work of the Police Authority 1991-1994. Belfast, Police Authority for Northern Ireland.
7. Royal Ulster Constabulary (n.d.) Royal Ulster Constabulary Charter: Raising the Standard. Belfast. RUC/HMSO

8. Royal Ulster Constabulary (1995) RUC Information Forum on Policing: Copies of Presentations. Belfast. 15 March, 1995.

Participation in the 1995 Community Consultation

The papers on pages 20 to 25 relate to Templegrove's participation in the Community Consultation which was carried out by the R.U.C. in March 1995.

19

include letter from RUC & questionnaire pages 20-23

TEMPLEGROVE ACTION RESEARCH LTD

**Room G1, 2nd Floor 13, Pump Street,
Derry/Londonderry, BT 48 6JG, Northern Ireland**
Telephone/Facsimile: 0504 374556 email: MBE.Smyth@ulst.ac.uk

The Sub Divisional Commander,
Strand Road RUC,
81a Strand Road,
Londonderry, BT48 7AA.

March 27th 1995

MS/PC

Dear Superintendent McCann,

Re. Community Consultation 1995

Thank you for sending us a copy of your questionnaire. We discussed the questionnaire at a Board Meeting of Templegrove Action Research, and we wish to make a number of points in relation to the questionnaire exercise, and to public participation in the drawing up of the RUC Five Year Strategy.

1. We welcome in principal, measures which effectively ensure that the views of the public are sought, and allowed to influence and shape policing policy and strategy. We recognise that this development has been long overdue. and has been made possible by the current

cease-fires. Policing in any society must depend on an exchange of views between the police and the society they serve.

2. However, we note that there are difficulties faced by the RUC in undertaking this exercise in the current circumstances pertaining in Northern Ireland. We gather that the questionnaire is to be distributed only to a select number of organisations and individuals. Whilst drawing a sample of the population for survey purposes is a commonly used practice, we are concerned that the sample should be random, and drawn from a wide range of sources representative of the community as a whole. We understand that this may not be the method used to collect data in this exercise. This is a matter of concern for us. On the one hand, we note that there is great reluctance, indeed refusal, on the part of certain sections of the community - particularly the Catholic community - to engage in dialogue with the RUC. The corollary to this is the RUC policy of not consulting with Sinn Féin. Understandable though these positions may be, they place insuperable obstacles in the path of any meaningful public consultative exercise. It is precisely between the parties where the greatest difficulties have occurred in the past that the need for open and frank communication is most crucial.

Whilst we welcome, in principal, the consultation process with the public in formulating policing strategy, it is not possible for us to rank policing tasks in order of priority before engaging with the broader issues such as the acceptability of the police force to the local community, and strategies designed to deal with these issues. Over the last 25 years of

24

violence there have been many incidents which live on in the memories of both the police force and the local community. In the course of our work we have become aware of feelings of suspicion, resentment and anger towards the police in both the Catholic and the Protestant community we are involved with. Within the Catholic community, the composition of the RUC is also an issue. These feelings and issues must be addressed before any successful professional police service can be delivered.

It is important that such a service is delivered equitably to all citizens irrespective of their religious beliefs or political persuasion or party membership and that all citizens are consulted regularly about the delivery of that service. As you are well aware current RUC officers have been regarded as "legitimate targets" by paramilitary groups for many years, and have lived with the danger, stress, bereavement and in some cases physical injuries which resulted from that situation. It is also important that police policy ensures that police officers who have been living with the danger of being killed are enabled to deal with the emotional aftermath of political violence and are facilitated to move beyond the current position of refusal to talk to certain groups or individuals in the community.

We think that these are crucial matters in relation to the formulation of policing strategy, and take precedence over any of the tasks listed in your questionnaire.

I hope these views are of use to you, even though they do not conform to your format.

Yours sincerely,

Marie Smyth.
Projects Director.
on behalf of Templegrove Action Research.

titles superimposed on photo

Urban regeneration and sectarian division
with specific reference to
segregation
and
the situation of enclave communities

A commentary on
on

Urban Regeneration in Derry Londonderry
Outline Strategy Proposals 1996-1999

prepared by
Marie Smyth
January 1996

27

Templegrove Action Research Limited was established in December 1993 with the aim of researching and documenting aspects of sectarian division in the North West. In September 1994, we began a two year investigation into segregation and enclave communities in Derry Londonderry which was funded by CCRU, The Joseph Rowntree Trust, the Ireland Fund, and the Londonderry Initiative. As part of that brief, Templegrove Action Research Limited was committed to make policy recommendations on any aspect of public policy related to sectarian division. To date, Templegrove has made submissions to the Divisional Planning Office on aspects of area planning and sectarian division, and to the Police Authority for Northern Ireland on policing and sectarian division. This submission on urban regeneration falls within that area of Templegrove's work.

Methods

In order to prepare this submission a number of documents were consulted and these are listed in the bibliography. We also consulted with the local political parties in the persons of Alderman Gregory Campbell of the Democratic Unionist Party, Councillor Cathal Crumley of Sinn Fein, Deputy Lord Mayor Richard Dallas of the Ulster Unionist Party, Councillor Mark Durkan of the Social Democratic and Labour Party, David Nicholl of the Ulster Democratic Party. At the suggestion of Sinn Fein, we also consulted with Eoin O'Brion of Sinn Fein in Belfast. Consultations took place with experts in the field, namely Andreas Cebulla, Director of the Northern Ireland Economic Research Council who was employed by the DOE to evaluate the current urban policy. We talked with Jim Smyth from the Department of Sociology at Queen's University who has written with Andreas Cebulla on the subject of urban regeneration in Northern Ireland. Frank Gaffikin, who, with Paul Sweeney, was employed by the DOE to conduct the community consultation on urban regeneration in Belfast made himself available for a consultation. We also spoke with Geraldine Tierney of Quartiers en Crise/ Neighbourhoods in Crisis in Brussels. We spoke to Donnie Sweeney of Gobnascale Family Centre and William Temple of the Fountain Area Partnership, who is also a local retailer. We also met with Luke Hasson, a member of the Derry Chamber of Commerce

and a local retailer. We are grateful to Barney Devine, Director of St Columb's Park House for the opportunity to mull over many of the ideas presented here. We are also grateful to all of those others who gave their time and thoughts towards the preparation process for this submission. This report represents a synthesis and analysis of the information and ideas gathered in these meetings together with the ideas gathered from the documentary sources. This does not imply that any of those consulted agree with the ideas presented in this report, which is the sole responsibility of the author and of Templegrove Action Research Limited.

The DOE Consultation Process

The consultation process engaged in by the DOE, in the course of considering their policies on urban regeneration are amongst the most open and accessible of any that we have experienced to date. The efforts of government departments to access the views of local residents is a welcome departure from the previous practices of government agencies. The employment of community brokers for the consultation process is a useful strategy, and has added to the accessibility of the exercise.

Consultation and the democratic deficit

Like the adage about the impossibility of being too rich or too thin, it is similarly impossible for government departments to engage in too much consultation. The so-called democratic deficit in Northern Ireland has left many citizens cynical, apathetic and alienated

28

from the processes of public decision making of any kind. The kind of consultation process used in this exercise, whilst laudable and undoubtedly a fruitful direction to move in, should not be laden with the expectation that all citizens will be immediately open and enthusiastic in their participation. Years of alienation, of exclusion from decision-making and of watching public resources being allocated in ways which many fundamentally disagreed with yet felt powerless to challenge has resulted in not only a democratic deficit, but also a deficit in trust - between government agencies and local citizens.

This was mentioned by one of the political representatives we interviewed in the form of political vetting, where, in the past, certain people were excluded from participation. The legacy of political vetting means that, for those newly-admitted to the consultation process, there are strong feelings about their past exclusion, and judgement is often reserved on the value and genuineness of the present exercise. Fears about discrimination, and the perception of being discriminated against still remain in both communities, - perhaps most strongly expressed in the Protestant community in the city at this point. The consultation process as it is presently constituted, must not only remain inclusive but must be seen to be so. In a divided city, this is not a straightforward principle to operationalise, since people from both sides of the sectarian divide experience genuine difficulties in participating in certain situations. Yet the principles of inclusion, openness and public participation are among the most crucial if we are to alter the culture of public life in the city - crucial part, we would argue, of the regeneration of the city.

The impact of consultation on subsequent policy

Writing of the 1987 public consultation on the Belfast Urban Area Plan, Milton ¹ states:

¹ Milton, K. (1993) Belfast: Whose City?" in Curtin, C., Donnan, H. and Wilson, T.M. (1993) Irish Urban Cultures. Belfast: Institute of Irish Studies, The Queen's University of Belfast, p. 24

The two-year process of public consultation resulted in very few changes, and the objectors emerged from the debate over the transportation policy with the clear impression that Belfast belongs to the planners who may dispose of it as they wish.

It is clearly important that the DOE not only engage in the consultation process, but also that the impact of that process is apparent in any subsequent strategies and plans which emerge after the end of the consultation period.

We commend the DOE for this important new departure in expanding the consultation process. We particularly congratulate them on specifically consulting with certain marginalised groups, such as women and young people.

1. We recommend that they give further consideration to how other marginalised groups can be routinely included in the future consultation processes, and what measures they could employ to facilitate the active participation of, for example, members of the travelling community, the deaf community, ex-prisoners, homeless people, or disabled people.
2. We recommend that the new policy be responsive to being shaped and amended by the content of submissions and face to face consultations. We recommend that the consultation process is followed through by further presentations of the draft final policy to those who were consulted and who submitted in this phase of the work. We also
29
recommend that the effect of consultation on subsequent policy be acknowledged and credited to the relevant consultee.

How does sectarian division affect urban regeneration?

O'Dowd (1993)² challenges the "compartmentalisation in the study of socio-economic change in Northern Ireland", and comments that "there has been little in-depth examination of the links between ethnic-national conflict and economic change". He points out that:

"whilst the ethnic-national conflict has been linked to space and locality,...carefully underlining the centrality of sectarian geography, this approach sees the latter as merely the outcome of inter-communal conflict. It pays little attention to how the state and wider processes of economic restructuring interact with locality and ethnic conflict."(my emphasis)

Any urban regeneration strategy for Derry Londonderry should address the issues of

² O'Dowd, L. (1993) "Craigavon: locality, economy and the state in a failed 'new city'", in Curtin, C., Donnan, H. and Wilson, T.M. (1993) Irish Urban Cultures. Belfast. Institute of Irish Studies, The Queen's University of Belfast.

sectarian economic, social, political and spatial division as fundamental social facts. Urban regeneration planning, as other kinds of intervention, acts - directly and indirectly - on such sectarian divisions in ways which either reinforces or restructures the divide. The effect of public policy on sectarian division has not been transparent since it is rarely, if ever, directly addressed in policy statements, nor are policy targets set on the issue so that the impact on sectarian division can be measured. It is not an easy or straightforward issue to incorporate into policy planning, but it is nonetheless crucial to begin to do so. Consultation with the various interested parties is one way of ensuring that the policy maker is aware of the differential impact of policy proposals on sections of the population on both sides of the sectarian divide. The next step is to address the anticipated direct and indirect effects of policy on the various aspects of sectarian division in policy formulation, and set targets for policy impacts.

Inter-relatedness of factors

Policy analysts have recognised that urban policy, like other areas of policy, have direct and indirect, intended and unintended impacts and consequences. In the last twenty years we have learned a little more about these effects. At this stage, it is possible to affirm that such effects occur and to make some predictions about the potential social impact of economic policy and vice versa. The "knock-on effects" can be between one policy area and another (for example, an economic policy, such as the establishment of the A.C.E. scheme has social effects) or the "knock-on effect" can be geographical. The potential geographic "knock-on: effect is illustrated in the Making Belfast Work Strategy Proposals:

PA Cambridge Consultants³ pointed out in their review of the Belfast Action Team initiative that there was considerable imbalance between the number of job opportunities available and the number of people looking for work across Northern Ireland. In this context any one policy seeking to stimulate job opportunities within Belfast would probably displace job opportunities from elsewhere unless the policy was able to increase the overall volume of job opportunities. In such an overall macro-economic environment local policies find net job creation an uphill task, though justified by the imbalance in levels of relative disadvantage and prosperity across Northern Ireland.

A second point made by PA Cambridge was that the nature of the difficulties faced was

not purely economic, but an amalgam of economic, social and physical problems

30

which, together, create conditions which can only be sufficiently flexible to recognise the complex inter-play of the economic, social and physical issues involved.⁴

It is of central importance that subsequent urban regeneration strategies for the city address the totality of the urban environment. Regeneration strategies must operate in ways which benefit and regenerate - not merely economically or environmentally, - but also

³ Cambridge, PA Consultants (1992) An Evaluation of the Belfast Action Team Initiative. Belfast. Making Belfast Work.

⁴ Making Belfast Work.(April 1994) Strategy Proposals 1994/95-1996/97. Belfast.

in ways which act positively on social and political life.

3. We recommend that subsequent urban regeneration strategy should recognise the interlocking and interdependent nature of economic, social, political and spatial/environmental factors. Such strategy should be innovative and flexible, allowing for the encompassing and addressing of issues which are traditionally beyond the remit of planners.

Definition and Boundaries

We would like to raise an issue which seems, at first sight, to be superfluous or imponderable. That question is this: what is this city composed of? By what is it defined? Is it composed of a land-mass, bounded by certain ordnance survey reference points and lines on maps? Is it a political entity, bounded by the political boundaries of local government? Is it a set of economic relations, defined, perhaps, geographically by a Travel to Work Area (TTWA)? Or is it a body of people with family and community relationships which bind them together? The way in which we define the city has ramifications for the way in which we plan for it, and therefore for the way in which any regeneration might take place.

If we take a strictly geographic definition of the city, then we no longer consider the needs of people or communities which lie beyond the geographical boundary, but still have links with the city on a daily basis. This has caused concern to some of those excluded in areas, for example, such as New Buildings. The adoption of a strictly geographic approach has a number of consequences.

Boundaries and sectarian division

Elsewhere we have documented the changing balance of population in the city in favour of Catholics. The movement out of the cityside, has been to some extent into the Waterside, but there has also been a fairly substantial movement of Protestants out of the city area, we surmise, to Eglinton, Limavady and perhaps beyond. Holding the boundary constant around the city constant will have the effect of excluding citizens who may have strong economic and social ties with the city, but who may have moved out, i.e. who have geographically moved, but may still maintain the same economic and social relationships with the city. A large number of these citizens are likely to be Protestant.

The sectarian consequences of line drawing

We would argue that this has the effect of apparently excluding from consideration those who have their primary economic or institutional relationships within the city, but who live or have moved beyond the geographic limit of the strategy. Since we know that those who have moved are disproportionately Protestants, it is clear that adopting a strictly geographic approach to the definition of the city runs the risk of consolidating the increasingly segregated living patterns which have been an increasing trend throughout the troubles.

Urban versus rural issues: where do you draw the line?

There are two other arguments for reviewing the adoption of a purely geographic definition of the city and it is related to the strategy of concentrating on urban regeneration. First, the economic relationship of the city with its hinterland in Donegal, and the economic potential

of cross border trade, and the financial incentives available from Europe to encourage such developments would suggest that a more permeable boundary around the city might be advantageous developmentally.

Second, the economic relationship of the city with its hinterland in the TTWA, - especially in the light of the outward migration of Protestants into the TTWA - merits consideration, particularly in relation to any "knock-on" effects of policy within the city area on the rural hinterlands, in for example, New Buildings, Eglinton or Strabane, which is considered to be a separate TTWA. The manner in which the city is regenerated has therefore potentially profound effects on peripheral areas, which, we strongly suggest, should be taken into consideration in the formulation of the strategy for urban regeneration of the city.

In the conclusion to our submission to the DOE on the Derry Area Plan ⁵, we argued:

... it is necessary to pay specific attention to issues of sectarian segregation and population shifts in planning for the city and district. Locations in the city vary in sectarian composition, and the shifting balance of population is a factor which affects the nature of and quality of life. Changing balances in populations have affected the safety and comfort with which certain people can remain living in particular areas.

4. We recommend that the physical boundary around the area covered by the strategy document be revised, and that any revised boundary be treated as only one of a number of ways of delineating the area affected and targeted by the strategy.
5. That the impact of any strategy on the sectarian balance in the city be constantly monitored and evaluated with the aim of the inclusion of both Protestants and Catholics in the social, economic and political life of the city.
6. That the interrelatedness of the urban and rural areas be recognised and the impact of any strategy on the rural hinterlands of the city be considered and monitored as part of the strategic planning, implementation and evaluation.

City Centre Space and Sectarian Division

The development of the city centre has been the most visible and striking aspect of urban regeneration policy in the city to date. In terms of the development of the city centre, the main mechanisms employed were: Urban Development Grants, - discretionary awards for property development and improvements for owner occupiers and developers operating within a one mile radius of business district; and Comprehensive Development Schemes which enabled the DOE to acquire and develop derelict land. The Londonderry Initiative embarked on the Town Centre Development Programme, which was evaluated as having

⁵ Smyth, M. (1995) Sectarian Division and Area Planning: a commentary on the Derry Area Plan 2011: Preliminary Proposals. Derry Londonderry, Templegrove Action Research.

made "a positive contribution to arresting urban decline"

32

City Centre

According to the comments of one of the political representatives we interviewed, the usage of the city centre varies according to religion, Catholics entering the city centre typically at Foyle Street and seeing the city centre as Guildhall Square and Protestants seeing the city centre as the Diamond and entering the city centre by Carlisle Road. The city centre is a significant social and political space. It is used in daytime as a shopping and eating place, where specific age groups gravitate towards different areas and facilities. Young people use it as a social space in which to meet friends and socialise. In the evening, the nightlife of the city includes bars restaurants, cinemas and occasional theatre productions. It is important that the city centre is maintained as an attractive and safe environment for public entertainment, in which all sections of the population can participate without fear. Issues of city centre safety particularly affect women and young people, especially young males from the Protestant community.

One of the ways of attempting to ensure a safe city centre is to maintain a level of residential accommodation within the city centre, with a mixed age and mixed income resident population. Galway, in its regeneration of the city centre, required developers to provide 10% of any developed city centre space for residential accommodation. The Fountain is a city centre community, and there are residents in the craft village, London Street, Pump Street, The role of this resident population is crucial in maintaining a safe and "living" city centre. Consideration needs to be given to the quality of life of residents in the city centre, and the impact of the city on their living conditions. Care needs to be exercised in the location of public entertainment facilities that potentially generate loud noise late at night. Clearly, such facilities should not be located near areas which house older people, such as the Fountain. Similarly, measures to regulate car parking and traffic flow in city centre residential areas should be adopted. The use of resident-controlled lockable parking bays (such as are used in the Markets area in Belfast) in residential city centre areas like the Fountain, should be given serious consideration.

7. We recommend that developers in the city centre be required to provide at least 10% of any developed city centre space for residential accommodation. We recommend the use of lockable parking bays in city centre residential areas and streets.

Similarly, we welcome the general upgrading of certain city centre streets, and the marked improvement in the attractiveness of the city centre. However, the attractiveness of the city centre, particularly to the evening window shopper, is marred by the steel security shuttering on shop windows, a reminder of the violence of the past. One local retailer who has devoted some thought to this issue has arrived at a solution. He proposes to install steel shutters behind the bay of his shop window, allowing the window to be dressed and viewed freely, yet limiting any intruder's access to the window space, since the steel shutters will prevent intruders from entering the rest of the shop.

8. We recommend that a scheme be set up to provide advice, design support and financial assistance to the proprietors of city centre premises to assist with the upgrading and redecoration of the exterior of their premises and replacement of exterior steel shuttering with suitable alternative security arrangements. This upgrading should be designed in keeping with the traditions and culture of the city and

avoid the "sameness" and Americanisation of the city centre.

33

Public space and political and cultural expression

The city centre is also an arena of political and civic expression for its citizens. Public spaces in the city centre are used for large civic occasions such as the Clinton visit, or the festivities at Hallow E'en. Other smaller public demonstrations or performances are associated with raising public awareness, or with the demonstration of political beliefs or cultural traditions associated with both communities. The burning of Lundy, the Apprentice Boys march, Bloody Sunday commemoration and other marches and demonstrations and sporting events all have significance for both communities. Our troubled recent history has made us wary of each other's political beliefs, yet in a healthy society, political expression is not only a basic right, but a natural part of community life. The issue of maintaining a public space which is available to both traditions, and creating - perhaps for the first time in Northern Ireland - the possibility of a city centre space which can facilitate the expression of both unionist and nationalist cultures is a new and challenging prospect. Any public demonstrations, marches or cultural celebrations that are associated with one community only must be organised in a way that is sensitive to the impact on neighbourhoods they pass through, and takes into account the inconvenience and disruption to traffic and everyday life. Ideally, arrangements for routing and stewarding marches and demonstrations should be agreed between the parties involved, the marchers, the residents and the local traders. In the past, the police have negotiated such matters with the demonstrators only.

9. We recommend that a body, composed of (male and female) community representatives of both unionist and nationalist communities, and local traders, be formed. We recommend that this body be responsible for receiving and negotiating the terms and conditions of marches sporting events and demonstrations in the city centre. We recommend that, when this body reaches internal agreement, the police be informed of the nature and content of the agreement between the interested parties, and that the arrangements for any march or demonstration be finalised between this body and the police.

We are concerned about the impact of Foyle side on the city centre as a retail space. A recent article in *City Lights* ⁶ referred to the economic polarisation of the city to "the gap between the 'haves' and the 'have nots'". Widespread deprivation exists in the city, and the proposed shift in strategy towards an emphasis on the Community Action Programme is a welcome recognition of this continuing level of need. However, the nature of city centre development has an impact on the "ownership" of the city centre. Smyth and Cebulla ⁷ (1995) have argued that:

"City centres are being gentrified and transformed into arenas of conspicuous consumption for the new upper service class."

⁶ McGrory, Joe. (1995) A Tale of Two Cities. *City Lights*, November 1995.

⁷ Smyth, J. and Cebulla, A. (1995) Belfast: the Reorganisation of Contested Space. unpub.

The nature of city centre development affects the deprived areas of the city also. The provision of what Smyth and Cebulla⁸ refer to as "hyphenated employment" (part-time, low-paid) means that many residents of outlying deprived areas can neither afford to shop in the new and more expensive retail outlets, nor can they take up the employment opportunities they offer, because of the poverty trap. The impact the kind of job opportunities created in city centre development has had on specific deprived communities in the city remains to be quantified. Unemployment and deprivation remain serious problems, to be addressed, not only through social policy interventions:- the effects of economic policy on deprivation should also be charted. It is important the city centre is a

34

space which belongs to all citizens, not just to those who can afford to shop in the more up-market retail outlets.

Concern has been expressed at the availability of the jobs created in developments such as Foyleside to local people. The casual observer notes that many of those employed in the (higher paid) management jobs in such developments appear to have been recruited from outside the local area, or have been transferred from other regions into the local branch of the company. We recognise that the skills base required may not be available in the first instance locally. However, perhaps greater co-ordination between the relevant Job Training agencies and the Department of the Environment and other economic development agencies could mean that training of local people in relevant skills could be tailored to and anticipate the needs of incoming employers.

10. We recommend that the city centre should contain a retail mix, with budget shopping facilities provided as well as more expensive outlets. The next phase of city centre development should be aimed at supporting the development of the cheaper end of the retail market.

11. We suggest that new investors in the area should be provided with incentives and support to develop packages which provide training and employment for local people in middle and senior management positions within their companies. We suggest that the nature and extent of local employment provided by incoming companies be monitored and regularly reviewed with each company by the main grant making body.

12. Measures to support the development of consumer co-operatives and buyers co-operatives in areas of social need should be included in the next phase of the Community Action Programme.

13. We recommend that the usage of the city centre by residents from deprived areas is researched and documented, and the patterns of city centre usage are used to inform future city centre development.

14. We suggest that the indirect effects of current city centre development on expectations of employment and quality of life in

⁸ Smyth and Cebulla (1995) op cit

designated deprived areas in the city is researched.

The impact of Foyleside on local businesses was also a matter which we considered. We were specifically concerned about the impact of this on the religio-political mix of the business

community in the city, but were not able to locate data on this issue, yet it remains a matter of concern. We consider the potential loss of Protestant businesses from a predominantly Catholic city to be detrimental to the social and political environment of the city, and to any claims that the city might make about its inclusiveness. Ultimately, this has not only social and political effects, but also economic effects.

15. We recommend that the religio-political mix of businesses in the city is transparently documented, monitored and reviewed on a regular basis.

Whilst the attraction of trans-national retailers potentially provides a wider catchment area for city retailers as a whole, it is also crucial economically, politically and socially

35

that local businesses which have roots in the area, and which have served local communities, are also supported in the next phase of city centre development. A substantial amount of public money has been devoted to retail development in the city centre to date, and no claw-back has operated for this funding. In the light of limitations on public finance, it seemed advisable to reconsider the policy on claw-back especially in profit making schemes. The ability of local businesses to compete on such an uneven playing-field is a matter for continuing concern and remains unaddressed.

16. We recommend that the next stage of city centre development is targeted at local city businesses.
17. We urge the DOE to review the position in relation to claw-back on projects, especially in those circumstances where those in receipt of regeneration grants make profits from the project which exceed the amount of the original grant.

We also note that much of the building work on city centre development sites was conducted by firms from outside the North-West. Whilst we recognise that local firms in some instances may not have had the capacity to undertake some of the larger developments, it seems desirable that where possible, local firms are used especially in projects supported from the public purse.

18. We recommend that grants for any building or development work associated with public regeneration schemes be awarded on condition that local labour is used in any building or other work associated with the project. In cases where this is not possible, grant holders should be required to seek permission from the granting authority to use labour from outside the area, as a condition of the grant.

The Londonderry Initiative's Town Centre Development Programme was evaluated as having made "a positive contribution to arresting urban decline"⁹, and the other schemes

⁹ DOE(NI). Urban Regeneration in Londonderry: Outline Strategy Proposals. DOE (NI)

played their part in dramatic improvement to the city centre environment. The City Promotion scheme had "gone some way towards restoring the social, economic, cultural and tourism importance of Londonderry in the North-West region."

19. We recommend that the City Promotion Scheme embarks on a scheme of promoting the buying of locally produced goods, allied to the promotion of tourism in the city linked to tourism in the region, in co-operation with Bord Failte and cross border tourism operations.

Two policy initiatives employed in the past did not fare so well in the evaluation. The Environmental Improvement Scheme which was available to public and voluntary bodies for upgrading physical infrastructure apart from property and the Community Action Programme did not achieve its potential. Further, the evaluation found "no evidence of marked improvement in the social and economic conditions of residents in the CAP (Community Action Programme) areas."

Residential space, community integrity and community development

The lack of improvement in the social and economic conditions of residents in the city's most deprived areas is rightly to provide a focus and a main priority for the next phase of urban regeneration. Clearly, if the city is to be a vibrant and successful place, it is imperative to address the situation of the residential areas of the city which have continued to bear the effects of economic recession, cuts in social, education and health services, and other reductions on public expenditure.

The strategy of targeting social need using indices of deprivation to identify geographic communities is one which has been adopted elsewhere, such as in the Making Belfast Work strategy. We will discuss later the implications of the measures used to target social need, within mainstream programmes and within special programmes such as Making Belfast Work or this programme. Here, we wish to discuss the issue of sectarian segregation and its implications for social and community interventions.

Segregation

Residential segregation has been an increasingly marked feature of residential areas, most notably of public housing areas and areas in the lower socio-economic group, since the late 1960's. Segregation has often meant that cities in particular have a "sectarian geography" whereby many Catholics and Protestants live in defined communities which are identifiably Protestant or Catholic. It is also clear that the level and nature of social need varies between Protestant and Catholic areas, and we will discuss this at greater length in the next section.

Two particular features of segregated city life have been of particular concern to us. The

first is the so-called "greening" of cities in Northern Ireland, whereby both Derry Londonderry and Belfast have experienced a change in the sectarian balance of the population in favour of Catholics; the second concern is the situation of enclave areas within the city. Both of these are underpinned by a concern about the changing nature and dynamics of segregation.

Much debate has centred around the desirability or otherwise of segregation, which has been an abiding feature of life in the city and integration is often posed as an alternative, or as a "solution". It is undoubtedly the case that segregation in the area has negative effects, amongst which are the loss of the opportunity to interact on a daily basis and learn about the "other" community. The resultant gap in knowledge and experience can all too easily be filled by myths and stereotypes, which, in turn, fuel fear and resentment. Segregation, by setting up known "Catholic" and "Protestant" areas, can also serve to facilitate some of the violence that some residents in segregated areas sought to avoid by moving to live in "safe" areas: segregated areas can be sitting targets for sectarian attack.

Current "practice wisdom" in community development and in community relations work holds that community development and other forms of intervention should employ the strategy of working within segregated areas in "single identity work", rather than pursue or impose any artificial "cross community" policy which does not reflect the priorities of those living in segregated areas.

The origin of the current patterns of segregation lie in the street violence and burning of houses in the late 60's and early 70's. People live and have lived in segregated areas for

37

reasons of safety and protection; the idea of living elsewhere can be fearful. The solution to segregation may therefore not be to engineer integration, but rather, by adopting measures which increase residents' feelings of safety, supporting residents' choice to live wherever they choose, and by facilitating the building of confident identities within those enclave communities in the first instance, the need for segregated living may be diminished.

One of the difficulties of designing social policy based on conceptions of communities as primarily geographic entities is that, since segregation is also geographically operational, such social policy can simply replicate sectarian division, without offering any method of moving beyond sectarian division for those who are ready to do so. A strategy which provides resources, not only for geographically defined communities, but also makes provision for "communities of interest" offers a parallel and complimentary method of targeting social need which offers the potential to move beyond sectarian division. By "community of interest" we mean communities which hold factors other than geography (or politico-religious identity) in common, - factors such as single parenthood, aging, caring responsibilities, or physical or emotional illness or disability. These communities of interest span the geographic communities throughout the city area. Schemes designed to address the needs of such "communities of interest" on a city wide or ward-wide basis would offer to individuals and groups within geographically defined communities the opportunity to work within the "community of interest", which exists both within and beyond their immediate area.

These "communities of interest" could be targeted on an area wide or a city-wide basis, and resources should be devoted to the establishment and consolidation of a city wide or area wide grass-roots network within each community of interest, composed, not of professional or voluntary workers, but rather composed of those members from within the "community of interest" itself. These networks would provide a useful alternative dimension to the

existing geographically defined community networks, and could offer advice, challenge and the potential of cross-fertilisation with geographically defined communities, which are often segregated in sectarian terms. The creation of such networks and the empowerment of such communities of interest has the additional benefit in policy terms of devoting resources directly to needs of marginalised groups and putting an additional mechanism in place which can "monitor from the grassroots," and lobby where necessary to increase the inclusiveness of existing community groups.

20. We recommend that indicators of deprivation which identify geographic areas of social need should only be deployed alongside another method of targeting social need and priority groups in the community. The method we suggest is the targeting of "communities of interest" such as single parents, older people and disabled people and their carers.

Widening networks

In order to broaden the vision of communities, and maintain their links with new developments both within Northern Ireland and within other similar cities in the European Union, it would be useful if Derry Londonderry was connected to some of the European networks such as European "Quartiers en Crise" network. Membership of such networks provides opportunities for local people to learn about what other cities elsewhere have achieved and how they have achieved it. Within the new community development programme, the inclusion of study visits for community activists to communities in Belfast, and other relevant cities in the European Union would ensure that local activists had the opportunity learn from the developments elsewhere, and to feature the achievements of local

38

communities. Study visits would be particularly useful in relation to economic regeneration programmes.

21. We recommend that Derry Londonderry become a member of the Quartiers en Crise network in Europe.

22. We recommend that a study visit programme for community activists be established.

23. We recommend that all grants and schemes should be equality proofed, so that all groups must account for how they involve women, young people, older people, disabled people, those from other communities and so on. Equality proofing does not rule out the possibility of single identity work on any given identity position, but it means that recipients must indicate an awareness of the range of marginalised groups and argue for the focus of their work.

The needs of enclave areas

In the conclusion to our submission to the DOE on the Derry Area Plan ¹⁰, we argued:

¹⁰ Smyth, M. (1995) Sectarian Division and Area Planning: a commentary on the Derry Area Plan 2011: Preliminary Proposals. Derry Londonderry, Templegrove Action Research.

It There is a strong argument for making a special case of the needs of enclave areas. may be, for example, that such areas should be regarded as villages or small settlements, even when they occur in urban settings. This would allow planners to formally recognise the integrity of such areas, their fears, special needs and their internal cohesion.

If, as we argue earlier, the solution to segregation is not engineered integration, but rather increasing the perceived and actual safety of enclave communities, then special attention and support should be available to enclave communities. This support could take the form of special assistance with street lighting and security, especially on the periphery of enclave areas, and enhanced levels of support for community facilities in such areas. As we argued elsewhere, enclave areas, like rural communities, may be providing facilities for relatively few people, in comparison to other communities who are not isolated in the same way. This principle should be accepted in relation to any grant applications, and any evaluation of cost effectiveness needs to be adjusted to allow for this "enclave factor".

24. We recommend that special attention and support should be available to enclave communities in the form of special schemes or by enhanced levels of support for community facilities and activities.

Since enclave communities can suffer as a result of isolation, the facilitation of contacts between enclave areas in similar situations can prove beneficial. Special consideration should be given to applications from enclave areas for financial support for study visits and networking outside the area could be given.

25. We recommend that assistance be provided specifically to enclave communities in the city to participate in networking with other enclave communities within and beyond the city area.

39

Community development and targeting unemployment: socially useful employment and social deprivation.

In community development terms, problems of unemployment, the lack of services such as home help services for older and disabled people and childcare services for families with young children, high levels of debt, vandalism, poor physical and mental health, and high levels of benefit dependency are characteristic of many of the areas in which community initiatives operate. In the past, the ACE scheme has been one of the few vehicles for the provision of community based employment aimed at meeting local needs. The problems with ACE schemes, namely their short term nature, the low levels of pay, and the lowering of job expectations, and the lack of continuity and stability within organisations heavily dependant on ACE labour have been documented elsewhere. Yet much of the work undertaken on community based ACE schemes, such as redecorating houses, welfare rights work, and childcare provision are socially useful, and of benefit to the community. The provision of quality training and properly paid and longer term employment at a local level to meet existing and already identified social needs in areas, would act to solve the employment issues in local areas whilst meeting social needs. The provision of training for local people in a range of areas, and the use of the "house party" model of training, which was used successfully in education on child abuse elsewhere in the city, opens the possibility of meeting the health education needs of the community. The kind of scheme used in the

Brownlow project in Craigavon engaged trained lay indigenous workers in health and social education schemes in the mental and physical health fields.

26. We recommend that local community schemes aimed at the creation of socially useful employment which addresses the community's social, educational and health needs be supported. The employment should incorporate proper training, and wages should be set at a realistic and fair level. Job creation schemes should prioritise quality jobs - i.e. full-time, properly paid with promotion prospects.

Unemployment and differential rates of unemployment as a highly significant issue in the sectarian dynamic. Perceptions of discrimination - perceived gains as loss to the other side. Monitoring of impact of regeneration strategies on unemployment rates and a transparent audit and open reporting of the jobs created by religion/politics, gender, age, tenure, hours per week, and occupational category. Clear employment targets need to be set, which are discussed in advance: Priority given to jobs which address the highest priority groups in terms of unemployment: priority to

Rural housing provision

One public representative raised the issue of housing provision in rural areas and the nature of housing developments in rural areas. Previously in rural areas, housing was provided in housing estates in ways that does not readily fit with the social patterns of rural life. One representative expressed the view that the provision of rural housing should not be in estates but in single or double houses, perhaps in the manner of the old government cottages built by the Housing Trust and district councils in the 1950's.

27. We recommend that the provision of housing in rural areas take account of the nature of community life in rural areas, and the practice of building multiples of housing units on one rural site be reviewed.

Targeting Social Need: Indicators of Deprivation and Sectarian Division

We welcome the increased concentration on areas of social need and the decision to focus on deprivation and social need in the next phase of the local urban regeneration strategy. There are a number of comments which we would like to offer in relation to targeting social need and indicators of deprivation.

Local effects of wider regional policy

Policy makers often make the point that schemes which target social need or address aspects of deprivation are often, in effect, attempting to ameliorate the gaps or failures in mainstream policy and provision. In the case of social deprivation in the city, there has been recent attention in the press to cuts in health and social services budgets for the Western area. This indicates the shrinking nature of mainstream programmes in health, social services and education. Real gaps and failures to address need in mainstream programmes create social problems in local communities. To ameliorate this situation, one can either set up special schemes to address the problems, or one can address the gaps in the mainstream

programmes which gave rise to many of the problems in the first place. Further, there is a certain irony attached to the sophisticated and careful consideration given to the kind of indicators of social deprivation to be used in the allocation of resources within ameliorative programmes in the light of the fact that mainstream funding for health and social services in Northern Ireland is allocated to the various Boards and Trusts simply on a capitation basis, without regard for deprivation factors. This method of allocation of funding has been introduced within the last year. Prior to that, resources were allocated based on expenditure in the previous financial year.

28. We recommend that the Department of the Environment presses for a working party to be set up involving all central and local government agencies, and voluntary agencies involved in designing and implementing intervention programmes aimed at deprivation. The brief of this working party would be to arrange for the methods and measures employed in measuring need and allocating expenditure to geographic or budget areas to be researched and documented. The aim of such research would be to make recommendations on how deprivation and social need can be identified and addressed within Northern Ireland in a manner which is (a) equitable and (b) coherent between geographic areas, groups within the community and between budget areas, programmes and measures.

It is the role of political representatives in Northern Ireland, and likewise in the city, to represent the interests of the constituency they serve. This can mean arguing for, and aggressively pursuing, resources for their area. In the context of a geographically segregated society, and one in which voting patterns are shaped by sectarian division, political representatives must find arguments to support their case for their own constituency. Given the principle of allocating scarce resources to the areas of greatest need and the use of indicators of deprivation in the allocation of resources, it has become necessary for political and community representatives to competitively argue the case of the greater level of need in their area. To do this they must find evidence to support their case, and, implicitly, to challenge the case put forward by other areas' representatives. This can lead to a culture of discussion which is characterised by the misinterpretation of evidence,

41

the skewing of the interpretation of evidence, the denial of the legitimacy of the needs of other communities, contests over the relative scale of deprivation, and the denial of past or current discrimination suffered by the other side. The time and energy of political and community representatives goes into the preparation of such evidence and arguments. The danger is that this acts to perpetuate what one representative referred to as "a grievance culture" in both Catholic and Protestant communities. The areas which have experienced the worst ravages of poverty unemployment and other forms of deprivation are almost invariably the same areas which have suffered most in terms of sectarian violence and the troubles. Feelings of deprivation and neglect in these communities are compounded by the fear, anger, mistrust and, in some cases bitterness due to their experiences of sectarian violence and the troubles.

Public representatives devote time and energy to making arguments which highlight the levels of need in their area, and to gathering evidence to support such arguments, often at the expense of a more innovative and co-operative approach - yet the system of resource allocation, as it is currently constituted, together with the realities of segregation, leave them with few if any other ways of proceeding. It is a matter of grave concern that this

state of affairs appears to act to deepen sectarian division between the two communities in the city, rather than otherwise.

Developments, such as the City Partnership, hold the potential for the development of a more unitary approach which might begin to acknowledge the diversity and interconnection between different forms of deprivation and build a co-operative rather than a competitive ethos. However, there is also a need for an audit of present policies in terms of how they impact on the sectarian divide in the city.

There are other arguments for revisiting the issue of allocation of resources to areas which score highest on indices of social deprivation. To base resource allocation solely on this method restricts programmes of intervention focussing on the highest levels of measured need, and on the most difficult or most entrenched situations. Yet some of the most effective use of resources may involve setting up some early intervention or preventative schemes which arrest the development of severe problems, -problems which are often less amenable to intervention in the medium or long term.

29. We suggest that any indicator of deprivation is used alongside other strategic targets and objectives, such as encouraging preventative projects or early intervention schemes.

Measuring social deprivation

The indicators of deprivation which make up of any system for measuring social deprivation are of great significance, in that measures of social deprivation can be use to determine resource allocation. Typically, such measures use indicators such as unemployment, health and other social and economic indicators to create a "league table" or a map of deprivation in the region. In preparing this submission, concern was expressed to us, particularly from within the Protestant community in the city, that the indicators used were not sensitive to the specific nature of deprivation within the Protestant communities. In reviewing this point, it was clear that the use of more economic measures, or specific kinds of economic measures of deprivation, such as unemployment might highlight deprivation in Catholic communities. In poorer Protestant communities, where unemployment might well be lower, the application of other economic measures, such as benefit dependence - which includes low-paid workers who are not unemployed - might reveal the specific features of deprivation in those communities.

42

A further area of concern is that current indicators tend to employ indicators which are aggregated measures of individual or family circumstances, such as unemployment or health. Yet some of a community's well-being depends on, for example, (i)the existence of an energetic and effective network of community organisations, the (ii)availability of accessible educational, health and social care amenities within the community, (iii)a balanced population age structure and profile that is not skewed towards any one age section of the population, (iv)a stable population, (v) low levels of vacant or derelict houses, (vi) access to good educational, and employment opportunities , access to a means of political expression and redressing grievances. There is evidence that some of these characteristics are more found more often in Catholic than in Protestant areas. We know that, for example, Protestant enclave communities in general, experience high levels of outward migration, high levels of vacant or derelict housing, typically contain disproportionate numbers of older people, yet might have lower levels of unemployment.¹¹

¹¹ Murtagh, B. (1994) Ethnic Space and the Challenge to Land Use Planning: a Study of Belfast's Residential Belfast. Centre for Policy Research, Paper 7, May 1994.

30. We would recommend that the different nature of deprivation in Protestant and Catholic communities be taken into account in designing or adopting any index or measure to target social need.
31. We would suggest that the adoption of any index or measure is discussed with political and community representatives from both Catholic and Protestant communities, and their views used to "fine tune" and "sectarian-proof" any measure adopted.
32. We suggest that further research and statistical work should be devoted to this issue, before an index can be created which is sensitive to differences in Catholic and Protestant communities and which can address these issues effectively.
33. We strongly recommend that the DOE address these issues at an early stage, and, in doing so holds consultations with all interested parties, including political and community representatives. To fail to address these issues at an early stage is to run the risk of further compounding existing divisions and the sense of grievance which is common to both communities.
34. We recommend that any allocation of monies to Protestant and Catholic communities in the area is transparent. We also suggest a system of open monitoring, accounting and evaluation of grants to Protestant and Catholic areas and projects, so that the amount of money allocated to each community is known and openly discussed at the policy proposal, implementation and evaluation stages

Summary of recommendations

1. We recommend that they give further consideration to how other marginalised groups can be routinely included in the future consultation processes, and what measures they could employ to facilitate the active participation of, for example, members of the travelling community, the deaf community, ex-prisoners, homeless people, or disabled people.
 2. We recommend that the new policy be responsive to being shaped and
-

amended by the content of submissions and face to face consultations. We recommend that the consultation process is followed through by further presentations of the draft final policy to those who were consulted and who submitted in this phase of the work. We also recommend that the effect of consultation on subsequent policy be acknowledged and credited to the relevant consultee.

3. We recommend that subsequent urban regeneration strategy should recognise the interlocking and interdependent nature of economic, social, political and spatial/environmental factors. Such strategy should be innovative and flexible, allowing for the encompassing and addressing of issues which are traditionally beyond the remit of planners.

Boundaries

4. We recommend that the physical boundary around the area covered by the strategy document be revised, and that any revised boundary be treated as only one of a number of ways of delineating the area affected and targeted by the strategy.
5. That the impact of any strategy on the sectarian balance in the city be constantly monitored and evaluated with the aim of the inclusion of both Protestants and Catholics in the social, economic and political life of the city.
6. That the interrelatedness of the urban and rural areas be recognised and the impact of any strategy on the rural hinterlands of the city be considered and monitored as part of the strategic planning, implementation and evaluation.

City Centre Development

7. We recommend that developers in the city centre be required to provide at least 10% of any developed city centre space for residential accommodation. We recommend the use of lockable parking bays in city centre residential areas and streets.

8. We recommend that a scheme be set up to provide advice, design support and financial assistance to the proprietors of city centre premises to assist with the upgrading and redecoration of the exterior of their premises and replacement of exterior steel shuttering with suitable alternative security arrangements. This upgrading should be designed in keeping with the traditions and culture of the city, and avoid the "sameness" and Americanisation of the city centre.

9. We recommend that a body, composed of male and female community representatives of both unionist and nationalist communities, and local traders, be formed. We recommend that this body be responsible for receiving and negotiating the terms and conditions of marches sporting events and demonstrations in the city centre. We recommend that, when this body reaches internal agreement, the police be informed of the nature and content of the agreement between the interested parties, and that the arrangements for any march or demonstration be finalised between this body and the police.
10. We recommend that the city centre should contain a retail mix, with budget shopping facilities provided as well as more expensive outlets. The next phase of city centre development should be aimed at supporting the development of the cheaper end of the retail market.
11. We suggest that new investors in the area should be provided with incentives and support to develop packages which provide training and employment for local people in middle and senior management positions within their companies, and the nature and extent of local employment provided by incoming companies be monitored and regularly reviewed with each company by the main grant making body.
12. Measures to support the development of consumer co-operatives and buyers co-operatives in areas of social need should be included in the next phase of the Community Action Programme.
13. We recommend that the usage of the city centre by residents from deprived areas is researched and documented, and the patterns of city centre usage are used to inform future city centre development.
14. We suggest that the indirect effects of current city centre development on expectations of employment and quality of life in designated deprived areas in the city is researched.
15. We recommend that the religio-political mix of businesses in the city is transparently documented, monitored and reviewed on a regular basis.
16. We recommend that the next stage of city centre development is targeted at local city businesses.
17. We urge the DOE to review the position in relation to claw-back on projects, especially in those circumstances where those in receipt of regeneration grants from public funds proceed to make profits from
45
the project which exceed the amount of the original grant.
18. We recommend that grants for any building or development work associated with public regeneration schemes be awarded on condition that local labour is used in any building or other work associated with

the project. In cases where this is not possible, grant holders should be required to seek permission from the granting authority to use labour from outside the area, as a condition of the grant.

19. We recommend that the City Promotion Scheme embarks on a scheme of promoting the buying of locally produced goods, allied to the promotion of tourism in the city linked to tourism in the region, in co-operation with Bord Failte and cross border tourism operations.

Residential space, community integrity and community development

20. We recommend that indicators of deprivation which identify geographic areas of social need should only be deployed alongside another method of targeting social need and priority groups in the community. The method we suggest is the targeting of "communities of interest" such as single parents, older people and disabled people and their carers.

21. We recommend that Derry Londonderry become a member of the Quartiers en Crise network in Europe.

22. We recommend that a study visit programme for community activists be established.

23. We recommend that all grants and schemes should be equality proofed, so that all groups must account for how they involve women, young people, older people, disabled people, those from other communities and so on. Equality proofing does not rule out the possibility of single identity work on any given identity position, but it means that recipients must indicate an awareness of the range of marginalised groups and argue for the focus of their work.

24. We recommend that special attention and support should be available to enclave communities in the form of special schemes or by enhanced levels of support for community facilities and activities.

25. We recommend that assistance be provided specifically to enclave communities in the city to participate in networking with other enclave communities within and beyond the city area.

26. We recommend that local community schemes aimed at the creation of socially useful employment which addresses the community's social, educational and health needs be supported. The employment should incorporate proper training, and wages should be set at a realistic and fair level. Job creation schemes should prioritise quality jobs - i.e. full-time, properly paid with promotion prospects.

27. We recommend that the provision of housing in rural areas take account of the nature of community life in rural areas, and the practice of building multiples of housing units on one rural site be

reviewed.

Indicators of deprivation

28. We recommend that the Department of the Environment presses for a working party to be set up involving all central and local government agencies, and voluntary agencies involved in designing and implementing intervention programmes aimed at deprivation. The brief of this working party would be to arrange for the methods and measures employed in measuring need and allocating expenditure to geographic or budget areas to be researched and documented. The aim of such research would be to make recommendations on how deprivation and social need can be identified and addressed within Northern Ireland in a manner which is (a) equitable and (b) coherent between geographic areas, groups within the community and between budget areas, programmes and measures.
29. We suggest that any indicator of deprivation is used alongside other strategic targets and objectives, such as encouraging preventative projects or early intervention schemes.
30. We would recommend that the different nature of deprivation in Protestant and Catholic communities be taken into account in designing or adopting any index or measure to target social need.
31. We would suggest that the adoption of any index or measure is discussed with political and community representative from both Catholic and Protestant communities, and their views used to "fine tune" and "sectarian-proof" any measure adopted.
32. We suggest that further research and statistical work should be devoted to this issue, before an index can be created which is sensitive to differences in Catholic and Protestant communities and which can address these issues effectively.
33. We strongly recommend that the DOE address these issues at an early stage, and, in doing so holds consultations with all interested parties, including political and community representatives. To fail to address these issues at an early stage is to run the risk of further compounding existing divisions and the sense of grievance which is common to both communities.
34. We recommend that any allocation of monies to Protestant and Catholic communities in the area is transparent. We also suggest a system of open monitoring, accounting and evaluation of grants to Protestant and Catholic areas and projects, so that the amount of money allocated to each community is known and openly discussed at the policy proposal, implementation and evaluation stages.

Footnotes

1 Milton, K (1993) "Belfast: Whose City?" in Curtin, C., Donnan, H. and Wilson, T.M. (1993) Irish Urban Cultures. Belfast. Institute of Irish Studies, The Queen's University of Belfast. p 34.

2 O'Dowd, L. (1993) "Craigavon: locality, economy and the state in a failed 'new city'", in Curtin, C., Donnan, H. and Wilson, T.M. (1993) Irish Urban Cultures. Belfast. Institute of Irish Studies, The Queen's University of Belfast.

3 Cambridge, PA Consultants (1992) An Evaluation of the Belfast Action Team Initiative. Belfast. Making Belfast Work.

4 Making Belfast Work. (April 1994) Strategy Proposals 1994/95-1996/97. Belfast

5 Smyth, M (1995) Sectarian Division and Area Planning: a commentary on the Derry Area Plan 2011: Preliminary Proposals. Derry Londonderry, Templegrove Action Research.

6 McGrory, Joe (1995) A tale of Two Cities. City Lights, November 1995.

7 Smyth, J. and Cebulla, A (1995) Belfast: the Reorganisation of Contested Space. unpub.

8 Smyth and Cebulla (1995) op cit

9 DOE(NI). Urban Regeneration in Londonderry: Outline Strategy Proposals. DOE (NI)

10 Smyth, M (1995) Sectarian Division and Area Planning: a commentary on the Derry Area Plan 2011: Preliminary Proposals. Derry Londonderry, Templegrove Action Research.

11 Murtagh, B (1994) Ethnic Space and the Challenge to Land Use Planning: a Study of Belfast's Peacelines. Belfast. Centre for Policy Research. Paper 7, May 1994.

Bibliography

Bogside and Brandywell Development Association. (August, 1995) Making a Start: Tus Leis an Obair: An Initial Area Regeneration Strategy for the Bogside and Brandywell, Derry. Derry. Bogside and Brandywell Development Association.

Brace, S., Devine, B. Funston, R. et al. (1995) Community Development in Protestant Areas in Londonderry: a seminar at St. Columb's Park House.1st July , 1995. Londonderry, CDPA Group.

Cambridge, PA., Consultants (1992) An Evaluation of the Belfast Action Team.

Campbell, G. (n.d.) Discrimination: Where Now? Gortreagh Printing.

Cebulla, A. (1995) Urban Policy in Londonderry: An Evaluation of Department of Environment's Urban Regeneration Initiatives. Central Statistics and Research Branch (DOE N.I.)

Cebulla, A. (1994) Urban Policy in Belfast: An Evaluation of Department of Environment's Physical Regeneration Initiatives. Central Statistics and Research Branch (DOE N.I.)

Cebulla, A. (1996) Urban Policy and Local Economic Interests in Northern Ireland: A City Comparison. International Journal of Urban and Regional Research. Autumn.

Cebulla, A. and Smyth, J. (1995) Duality and Division: Deindustrialisation and Social Structure in Belfast. unpublished paper.

Clar Nua (1995) A Policy Framework for Reconstruction in West Belfast. Belfast. Clar Nua.

Department of Economic Development (December 1995) Press Notice: Unemployment - November 1995. Belfast. DED N.I.

DOE N.I.(1995) Urban Regeneration In Londonderry: Outline Strategy Proposals 1996-1999: Regeneration Through Partnership. Londonderry. DOE N.I.

DOE N.I.(January 1995) Urban Initiative: Londonderry Sub-Programme Submission (unpublished) Londonderry. DOE N.I.

DOE N.I.(October - November 1995) Consultation with Women's Groups on Outline Strategy Proposals 1996 - 1999 for Urban Regeneration in Londonderry. (guide-lines: unpublished) Londonderry. DOE N.I.

Londonderry DUP (1995) Report on Recruitment Results in the North West: September 1995. Londonderry. Londonderry DUP.

McDonough R. (n.d.) A Partnership Approach to Regeneration: Some Guiding Principles. Belfast. Making Belfast Work.

McGrory, J. (1995) A Tale of Two Cities. Derry/Londonderry. City Lights.

McKibben, T. (1995) Londonderry Residents Survey. Central Statistics and Research Branch (DOE N.I.)

Murtagh, B. (1994) Ethnic Space and the Challenge to Land Use Planning: A Study of Belfast's Peace Lines. Belfast. Centre for Policy Research. Paper 7, 1994.

Making Belfast Work. (1995) Action Programme '95 -'96: Expenditure Programme 1995-1996. Belfast. Making Belfast Work

Making Belfast Work. (March 1995) Strategy Statement: March 1995. Belfast. Making Belfast Work

North West Community Network (December 1995) "Urban Regeneration in Londonderry - Outline Strategy Proposals 1996-1999" Network Response (draft). Derry Londonderry. North West Community Network.

Northern Ireland Economic Council. (June 1995) The Economic Implications of Peace and Political Stability in Northern Ireland. Belfast. Northern Ireland Economic Council. Occasional Paper no 4.

Northern Ireland Economic Council. (April 1995) Through Peace to Prosperity: Proceedings of the Peace Seminar hosted by the Economic Council. Belfast. Northern Ireland Economic Council. Occasional Paper no 3.

O'Dowd, L. (1993) "Craigavon: locality, economy and the state in a failed 'new city'", in Curtin, C., Donnan, H. and Wilson, T.M. (1993) Irish Urban Cultures. Belfast. Institute of Irish Studies, The Queen's University of Belfast.

Quartiers en Crise/ Neighbourhoods in Crisis. (1995) The International Association for the Regeneration of Neighbourhoods in Crisis (Quartiers en Crise) Summary of Claude Jaquier's Report on the Third Quartiers en Crise Programme. Brussels. Quartiers en Crise.

Smyth, J. and Cebulla, A. (1995) Belfast: The Reorganisation of Contested Space. draft. unpublished paper.

Smyth, J. and Cebulla, A. (1995). Culture and Change: Community Responses to Urban Problems in Belfast and Derry. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Urban Affairs Association, Portland, Oregon. May 1995.

Sweeney, P. and Gaffikin, F. (1995) Listening to People: A report on the Making Belfast Work Consultation Process. Belfast: Making Belfast Work.

Ulster Community Action Network (1994) Ireland Funds Report. unpublished report.

Ulster Community Action Network (1994) IFI Report 1989 -1994. unpublished report.

Women in Gobnascale (1995) Urban Regeneration Strategy 1996-1999: Submission from women in Gobnascale. unpublished paper.

50
APPENDIX 1

TEMPLEGROVE ACTION RESEARCH LTD

A group of people from the Catholic and Protestant communities in the North West and elsewhere in Northern Ireland came together during 1993 to examine ways of advancing the dialogue between the Catholic and Protestant communities in the North West and beyond. After a number of meetings the group clarified their intention to undertake the specific piece of work outlined here. A company limited by guarantee and not having a share capital was formed under the Companies (Northern Ireland) Order 1986. The company was formed in order to provide a structure which would ensure democratic management of the project. Several of the company directors are drawn from the communities in the study, in order to ensure close contact with the communities involved in the project. The aims of Templegrove include:

- to undertake action research in the North West of Ireland
- to record and publish the experiences of people in the North West who are living with sectarian residential division
- to explore ways in which sectarian residential division affects the population structure and mix, and the welfare of the communities
- to examine ways in which minorities can be sustained, and the drift towards sectarian homogeneity be arrested
- to endeavour at all times to promote improved relationships and open dialogue between Catholic and Protestants in the local communities
- to ensure that a fair and balanced representation is given to views emanating from both the Catholic and Protestant community in the work of the company.
- to facilitate community education which addresses the issues of segregation and sectarianism.

51
APPENDIX 2

POPULATION MIGRATIONS AND SEGREGATION IN DERRY LONDONDERRY

1. We first examined the population figures by religion for the entire city area, using a grid square which is approximately bounded by Termon House on the Letterkenny Road in the South West, Drumahoe Bridge in the South East, Thornhill College in the North East and the Sewage Works at Elagh Road in the North West. We extracted total population figures from the 1971, 1981 and 1991 census of population, and a breakdown by religion for each year. (As is widely known, the figures for 1981 are not entirely reliable due to difficulties with the return rate in that census.)

TABLE 1: POPULATION OF DERRY/LONDONDERRY BY RELIGION FROM THE 1971,1981& 1991 CENSUS OF POPULATION FOR NI USING GRID REFERENCES C410150 - C464212

	1971	1981	1991	% change
Total Roman Catholics	40188	37855	54658	+36%
Total Protestants	15907	12125	10924	-31%
Total Presbyterian	8134	5828	5463	-
Total Church of Ireland	6800	5705	4873	-
Total Methodists	973	592	588	-
Total "other" & "not stated"	9119	13492	4921	-
 Total population	 65214	 63472	 70503	 +8%

An examination of the figures for the urban area of the city shows a change in the ratio of Protestants to Catholics in the city, a substantial decline in the overall total Protestant population in the city as a whole. (See Table 1)

2. The second examination of the statistics was aimed at establishing internal migration within the urban area. For this purpose, an examination of the small area statistics using grid squares was conducted. A patchwork of grid squares which approximated the Waterside and Cityside areas was constructed, and the total population figures, again broken down by religion, were examined. Table 3 shows the Waterside figures, and Table 4 shows the figures for the Cityside.

TABLE 2: WATERSIDE (1): TOTAL POPULATION BY RELIGION

	1971	1981	1991	% change 1971-1991
Total Roman Catholic	7708	5930	8032	+4%
Total Protestant	7849	9244	9935	+27%
Total Presbyterian	4167	4434	5053	
Total Church of Ireland	3063	4305	4336	
Total Methodist	619	505	546	
Total Other, none & not stated	2709	3854	3093	
Total other	976	826	1343	
Total not stated	1733	3028	1263	
Total none			487	
Total population present on census night	18812	19521	21389	+12%
Total population usually resident	-	19028	21060	

The Waterside Catholic population figures for 1981 as with other figures for that year, (particularly for the Catholic population) are not reliable. Nonetheless, there has been a small increase in the Catholic population in the Waterside, from 7708 in 1971 to 8032 in 1991: an increase of 324. The increase in the Waterside Protestant population is somewhat larger: from 7849 in 1971 to 9935 in 1991: an increase of 1903.

An examination of the figures for the Cityside (Table 3) shows that there has also been an increase in the Catholic population in the Cityside, from 33951 in 1971 to 48233 in 1991, an increase of 14282. The Protestant population, on the other hand, has decreased from 8459 in 1971 to 1407 in 1991, a decrease of 7052. This decrease of 7052 is not offset by the increase of 1903 in the Waterside Protestant population. The overall trend in population movement is of Protestant movement out of the city area completely.

TABLE 3: CITYSIDE(2): TOTAL POPULATION BY RELIGION

	1971	1981	1991	% change 1971-1991
Total Roman Catholics	33951	32683	48233	+42.1%
Total Protestants	8459	2874	1407	-83%
Total Presbyterian	4227	1444	656	
Total Church of Ireland	3861	1327	690	
Total Methodist	371	103	61	
Total other, none & not stated	6706	9987	3810	-43.2%
Other denominations total	825	574	532	
Not stated total	5881	9413	2755	
Total none	-	-	523	

Total persons present on census night	49623	45238	53088	+7%
Total persons	-	45544	5345	
		53		

Table 1 suggests that the decline in the Protestant population for the city as a whole is 4983 over the twenty year period. Tables 2 and 3, which use different land boundaries, suggest that the overall decline in Protestant population in the Cityside of 7052 is somewhat offset by an increase in the Waterside Protestant population of 1903, giving an overall decline of 5149 for the city as a whole. It seems reasonable to conclude, therefore, that the city population of Protestants has declined by at least 5000 people.

However, this figure may be an underestimation. It has been argued that the majority of those who respond "none" to the religion question on the census are, in fact, Protestant. Bearing this in mind, we should note-, according to Table 1 - an overall decline in this category in the overall city population of 4198. There has been an equivalent increase of 384 in the Waterside "none, other and not stated" population in the twenty year period, giving some credence to the view that these people are, in fact, Protestant. A corresponding decline in the same population in the Cityside (see Table 3) of 2896 would tend to confirm this view. This means that the overall decrease citywide in this category is 2512 people. Potentially, therefore, the population loss of Protestants to the city is 5149 plus some of this number: a maximum potential loss of 7661, although it is unlikely that all of the 2512 "none other and not stated" category are Protestants.

What is evident from an examination of the Cityside and Waterside figures is an internal shift of Protestants from the west to east banks of the city, in the context of an overall decline in the Protestant population of the city of between five to six and a half thousand people.

Some of these changes in population balance are not due to migration, but to natural increases in the population. Migration occurs for a variety of reasons, and sometimes a combination of several reasons: upward mobility; acquisition of better housing; employment; decline of the area due to vandalism, redevelopment, as well as fear, intimidation and sectarian issues.

3. We looked at the Fountain and Gobnascale as examples of enclave communities. We examined small area statistics for two communities within the city.

3a. The geographic definition of the Fountain community proved problematic, in that the community boundaries have contracted with the decline in population. We used contemporary boundaries as defined by current residents, and the figures here are the nearest grid square data within those boundaries.

	1971	1981	1991	% change 1971-1991
TOTAL POPULATION OF THE FOUNTAIN (3)	1282	668	467	-63.6%
as a % age of the total 1971 population	100	52.11	36.43	
Total Roman Catholic	203	75	64	-68.5%
Total Presbyterians	492	183	130	-73.6%

Total Church of Ireland	562	294	144	-74.4%
Total Methodist	71	30	16	-77.5%
Total Other	108	96	83	-23.1%

54

What emerges from the examination of the Fountain small area statistics is the severity of the population decline whilst the religious balance of the population - predominantly Protestant - remains virtually unaltered. Our preliminary inquiries indicate that a variety of factors appear to be involved in this depopulation: redevelopment; the housing market; a particular form of housing blight; and sectarian issues including violence and intimidation. What is clear is that the Fountain is a community which requires urgent and special support, if it is to survive culturally and socially. This means that special arrangement may need to be made to recognise the plight of this community, which has been uniquely affected by a combination of factors. To fail to recognise the special situation of the Fountain and to fail to take the steps required to support the community is to contribute by default to the processes of increased segregation and neglect which are endangering the viability of the Fountain as a community. The Fountain, as an enclave community, has special needs. The needs of enclave communities deserve special recognition within the Area Plan, on a par with the attention paid to rural village communities.

3b The population figures and religious breakdown for Gobnascale were examined using the same definition and method of extracting the data. Whilst the total Catholic population in the area has fluctuated slightly, there has been a dramatic decline in all other denominations, including a decline in the category "Other, None and Not Stated." The marked trend towards increased segregation is evident. This trend is symptomatic of a wider trend towards an increase in internal segregation in two communities, which we suggest may be indicative of a wider trend towards increased segregation.

TOTAL POPULATION OF GOBNASCALE (4)	1781	1741	1312	%
Total Roman Catholic	1098	1246	1190	+8.4
Total Presbyterians	200	21	5	-97.5
Total Church of Ireland	156	13	0	-100
Total Methodist	41	0	0	-100
Total Other, None & Not Stated	268	461	117	-56%

First published 1996
by Templegrove Action Research Limited
13 Pump Street, Derry Londonderry, BT48 6JG

© Templegrove Action Research Limited
Written by Marie Smyth and Ruth Moore
Typeset by Pauline Collins, Ruth Moore and Marie Smyth
Photographs by Ruth Moore, Marie Smyth and Madeleine Callaghan
Final editing by Marie Smyth

Printed by Print n Press, Foyle Road, Derry Londonderry

All Rights Reserved

ISBN 1 900071 00 5

